This document proposes improvements to the XML stream features definition for inclusion in the specification that supersedes RFC 3920.
Legal

Copyright

This XMPP Extension Protocol is copyright © 1999 – 2020 by the XMPP Standards Foundation (XSF).

Permissions

Permission is hereby granted, free of charge, to any person obtaining a copy of this specification (the "Specification"), to make use of the Specification without restriction, including without limitation the rights to implement the Specification in a software program, deploy the Specification in a network service, and copy, modify, merge, publish, translate, distribute, sublicense, or sell copies of the Specification, and to permit persons to whom the Specification is furnished to do so, subject to the condition that the foregoing copyright notice and this permission notice shall be included in all copies or substantial portions of the Specification. Unless separate permission is granted, modified works that are redistributed shall not contain misleading information regarding the authors, title, number, or publisher of the Specification, and shall not claim endorsement of the modified works by the authors, any organization or project to which the authors belong, or the XMPP Standards Foundation.

Warranty

## NOTE WELL: This Specification is provided on an "AS IS" BASIS, WITHOUT WARRANTIES OR CONDITIONS OF ANY KIND, express or implied, including, without limitation, any warranties or conditions of TITLE, NON-INFRINGEMENT, MERCHANTABILITY, or FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE. ##

Liability

In no event and under no legal theory, whether in tort (including negligence), contract, or otherwise, unless required by applicable law (such as deliberate and grossly negligent acts) or agreed to in writing, shall the XMPP Standards Foundation or any author of this Specification be liable for damages, including any direct, indirect, special, incidental, or consequential damages of any character arising from, out of, or in connection with the Specification or the implementation, deployment, or other use of the Specification (including but not limited to damages for loss of goodwill, work stoppage, computer failure or malfunction, or any and all other commercial damages or losses), even if the XMPP Standards Foundation or such author has been advised of the possibility of such damages.

Conformance

This XMPP Extension Protocol has been contributed in full conformance with the XSF’s Intellectual Property Rights Policy (a copy of which can be found at <https://xmpp.org/about/xsf/ipr-policy> or obtained by writing to XMPP Standards Foundation, P.O. Box 787, Parker, CO 80134 USA).
1 Introduction

RFC 3920 introduced the concept of stream features. Implementation experience has revealed several shortcomings in the current definition and usage of stream features:

- Because not all stream features include a mechanism for specifying that negotiation of the feature is required, servers and clients cannot know with certainty when the stream negotiation has been completed and therefore when it is acceptable to begin sending XML stanzas over the stream.
- The server dialback protocol does not have a stream feature associated with it.

Those shortcomings are addressed in this document.

Note: The recommendations from this document were NOT incorporated into RFC 6120 and this document is Obsolete.

2 Required Flag

The XMPP stream feature for Transport Layer Security (TLS) includes a <required/> child element that can be used to indicate that negotiation of TLS must be completed before proceeding with the rest of the stream negotiation. However, as defined in RFC 3920 the remaining stream features do not include the ability to flag that negotiation of the feature is required in order to (1) proceed with the negotiation or (2) begin sending XML stanzas. Because the non-TLS features lack a required flag, it is not possible for the initiating entity to know definitively how to proceed at any given stage in the stream negotiation, and the only way for the initiating entity to know whether it may begin sending XML stanzas is to attempt to send them (the receiving entity will return a <not-authorized/> stream error if not all required features have been negotiated). This state of affairs is suboptimal. Therefore, every stream feature must include the ability to flag the feature as required or not required.

When the initiating entity receives a stream features element with no features containing a <required/> element, it knows that the receiving party will accept XML stanzas over the stream.

The following examples show a possible flow of stream negotiation between a client and a server, using the required flag for all but one of the features and following the order specified in Recommended Order of Stream Feature Negotiation (XEP-0170). (This example is more verbose than a typical stream negotiation flow, but is provided here for the sake of completeness.)

---

Listing 1: A stream negotiation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Side</th>
<th>Message</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td><code>&lt;stream:stream xmlns='jabber:client' xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams' to='example.com' version='1.0'&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td><code>&lt;stream:stream xmlns='jabber:client' xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams' id='c2s_123' from='example.com' version='1.0'&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td><code>&lt;stream:features&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;starttls xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-tls'&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;required/&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;/starttls&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;/stream:features&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td><code>&lt;starttls xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-tls'/&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td><code>&lt;proceed xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-tls'/&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>[TLS negotiation]</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td><code>&lt;stream:stream xmlns='jabber:client' xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams' to='example.com' version='1.0'&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td><code>&lt;stream:stream xmlns='jabber:client' xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams' from='example.com' id='c2s_234' version='1.0'&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td><code>&lt;stream:features&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;mechanisms xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;mechanism&gt;EXTERNAL&lt;/mechanism&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;mechanism&gt;DIGEST-MD5&lt;/mechanism&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;mechanism&gt;PLAIN&lt;/mechanism&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;required/&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;/mechanisms&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><code>&lt;/stream:features&gt;</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td><code>&lt;auth xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'</code></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
mechanism = 'DIGEST-MD5' />

S: <challenge xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'>
  cmVhbG09InNvbWVyZWJsb29sJmJhYnhvcGVyQmFzZT0i
  LGNoYXJzZXQ9dXRmLTgsYWxnb3JpdGhtPW1kNS1zZWNz
</challenge>

C: <response xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'>
  cmVhbG09InNvbWVyZWJsb29sJmJhYnhvcGVyQmFzZT0i
  LGNoYXJzZXQ9dXRmLTgsYWxnb3JpdGhtPW1kNS1zZWNz
</response>

S: <challenge xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'>
  cmVhbG09InNvbWVyZWJsb29sJmJhYnhvcGVyQmFzZT0i
  LGNoYXJzZXQ9dXRmLTgsYWxnb3JpdGhtPW1kNS1zZWNz
</challenge>

C: <response xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'>
  cmVhbG09InNvbWVyZWJsb29sJmJhYnhvcGVyQmFzZT0i
  LGNoYXJzZXQ9dXRmLTgsYWxnb3JpdGhtPW1kNS1zZWNz
</response>


C: <stream:stream xmlns='jabber:client'
  xmlns:xmpp='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams'
  to='example.com'
  version='1.0'/>

S: <stream:stream xmlns='jabber:client'
  xmlns:xmpp='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams'
  id='c2s_345'
  from='example.com'
  version='1.0'/>

S: <compression features='http://etherx.jabber.org/features/compress'/>
  <method zlib/>
  </compression>

C: <compress xmlns='http://etherx.jabber.org/protocol/compress'/
  method=zlib/>

S: <compressed xmlns='http://etherx.jabber.org/protocol/compress'/>
3 Dialback Stream Feature

As specified in RFC 3920, support for the server dialback protocol is currently advertised through inclusion of a dialback namespace prefix in the stream header:

Listing 2: Stream header with dialback namespace advertisement

```xml
<stream:stream
    xmlns='jabber:client'
    xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams'
    to='example.com'
    version='1.0'>
</stream:stream>
```

However, it is not clear if inclusion of the dialback namespace indicates that a server supports the server dialback protocol or that it requires negotiation of server dialback. To make this
clear, we define a stream feature for server dialback:

### Listing 3: Dialback stream feature

```xml
<stream:features>
  <dialback xmlns='urn:xmpp:features:dialback'>
    <required/>
  </dialback>
</stream:features>
```

Consider the following scenario, in which Server1 provides a self-signed certificate. According to Server2's local service policy, it does not consider self-signed certificates to be trustworthy and therefore requires negotiation of server dialback in this case.

### Listing 4: A stream negotiation with server dialback

S1: `<stream:stream xmlns='jabber:server' xmlns:db='jabber:server:dialback' xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams' to='example.com' version='1.0'>`

S2: `<stream:stream xmlns='jabber:server' xmlns:db='jabber:server:dialback' xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams' id='s2s_123' from='example.com' version='1.0'>`

S2: `<stream:features>
  <starttls xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-tls'>
    <required/>
  </starttls>
</stream:features>`

S2: `<proceed xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-tls'/>`

[TLS negotiation with self-signed certificate]

S1: `<stream:stream xmlns='jabber:server' xmlns:db='jabber:server:dialback' xmlns:stream='http://etherx.jabber.org/streams' to='example.com' version='1.0'>`

S2: `<stream:stream>`
4 Security Considerations

The improvements described herein do not introduce any new security concerns above and beyond those defined in RFC 3920.

5 IANA Considerations

No interaction with the Internet Assigned Numbers Authority (IANA) is required as a result of this document.

6 XMPP Registrar Considerations

6.1 Stream Features

As specified in Server Dialback (XEP-0220), the XMPP Registrar includes a dialback stream feature of 'urn:xmpp:features:dialback' in its registry of stream features (see <https://xmpp.org/registrar/stream-features.html>.)

---

1The Internet Assigned Numbers Authority (IANA) is the central coordinator for the assignment of unique parameter values for Internet protocols, such as port numbers and URI schemes. For further information, see <http://www.iana.org/>.


3The XMPP Registrar maintains a list of reserved protocol namespaces as well as registries of parameters used in the context of XMPP extension protocols approved by the XMPP Standards Foundation. For further information, see <https://xmpp.org/registrar/>.
7 XML Schema

7.1 SASL Stream Feature

Note: The following provisional schema is intended to replace the existing schema for the SASL stream feature.

```xml
<?xml version='1.0' encoding='UTF-8'?>
<xs:schema
    xmlns:xs='http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema'
    targetNamespace='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'
    xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-sasl'
    elementFormDefault='qualified'>

    <xs:element name='mechanisms'>
        <xs:complexType>
            <xs:sequence>
                <xs:element name='mechanism' maxOccurs='unbounded' type='xs:string'/>
                <xs:element name='required' minOccurs='0' maxOccurs='1' type='empty'/>
            </xs:sequence>
        </xs:complexType>
    </xs:element>

    <xs:element name='auth'>
        <xs:complexType>
            <xs:simpleContent>
                <xs:extension base='xs:string'>
                    <xs:attribute name='mechanism' type='xs:string' use='optional'/>
                </xs:extension>
            </xs:simpleContent>
        </xs:complexType>
    </xs:element>

    <xs:element name='challenge' type='xs:string'/>
    <xs:element name='response' type='xs:string'/>
    <xs:element name='abort' type='empty'/>
    <xs:element name='success' type='empty'/>
    <xs:element name='failure'>
        <xs:complexType>
            <xs:choice minOccurs='0'/>
        </xs:complexType>
    </xs:element>
</xs:schema>
```
<xs:element name='aborted' type='empty'/>
<xs:element name='incorrect-encoding' type='empty'/>
<xs:element name='invalid-authzid' type='empty'/>
<xs:element name='invalid-mechanism' type='empty'/>
<xs:element name='mechanism-too-weak' type='empty'/>
<xs:element name='not-authorized' type='empty'/>
<xs:element name='temporary-auth-failure' type='empty'/>
</xs:choice>
</xs:complexType>
</xs:element>

<xs:simpleType name='empty'>
  <xs:restriction base='xs:string'>
    <xs:enumeration value=''/>
  </xs:restriction>
</xs:simpleType>
</xs:schema>

### 7.2 Resource Binding Stream Feature

Note: The following provisional schema is intended to replace the existing schema for the Resource Binding stream feature.

```xml
<?xml version='1.0' encoding='UTF-8'?>
<xs:schema
  xmlns:xs='http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema'
  targetNamespace='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-bind'
  xmlns='urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:xmpp-bind'
  elementFormDefault='qualified'>
  <xs:element name='bind'>
    <xs:complexType>
      <xs:sequence>
        <xs:choice minOccurs='0' maxOccurs='1'>
          <xs:element name='resource' type='resourceType'/>
          <xs:element name='jid' type='fullJIDType'/>
        </xs:choice>
        <xs:element name='required' minOccurs='0' maxOccurs='1' type='empty'/>
      </xs:sequence>
    </xs:complexType>
  </xs:element>
</xs:schema>
```
7.3 Server Dialback Stream Feature

Note: The following defines a schema for the proposed Server Dialback stream feature.

```xml
<?xml version='1.0' encoding='UTF-8'?>
<xs:schema
  xmlns:xs='http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema'
  targetNamespace='urn:xmpp:features:dialback'
  xmlns='urn:xmpp:features:dialback'
  elementFormDefault='qualified'>
  <xs:element name='dialback'>
    <xs:complexType>
      <xs:sequence>
        <xs:element name='required'
          minOccurs='0'
          maxOccurs='1'
          type='empty'/>
      </xs:sequence>
    </xs:complexType>
  </xs:element>
  <xs:simpleType name='empty'>
    <xs:restriction base='xs:string'>
      <xs:enumeration value=''/>
    </xs:restriction>
  </xs:simpleType>
</xs:schema>
```
Acknowledgements

Thanks to Ralph Meijer and Joe Hildebrand for their comments.